

NAILAH K. BYRD CUYAHOGA COUNTY CLERK OF COURTS

1200 Ontario Street Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Court of Common Pleas

ANSWER OF... July 15, 2019 10:04

By: L STEWART HASTINGS 0025852

Confirmation Nbr. 1761571

STATE OF OHIO EX REL. LAWRENCE BRESLER ET AL

CV 19 916774

VS.

Judge: DICK AMBROSE PATRICIA BRITT

Pages Filed: 10

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS CUYAHOGA COUNTY, OHIO

THE STATE OF OHIO ex rel. LAWRENCE BRESLER, et. al.) CASE NO. CV 19 916774)
Relators,) JUDGE DICK AMBROSE
vs. PATRICIA BRITT, City Clerk, Clerk of Counsel (Sic))) ANSWER TO RELATORS' COMPLAINT))
Respondent)))

Respondent Patricia Britt, Clerk of Council (Ms. Britt), sued in her official capacity only, responds to Relators' Complaint as follows:

ANSWER

- 1. In response to Paragraph one of the complaint Ms. Britt states that she has determined the sufficiency of a petition for initiative submitted by these Relators, and determined that the petition is insufficient.
- 2. Ms. Britt admits the allegations in paragraph two of the complaint.
- 3. Ms. Britt denies the allegations in paragraph three of the complaint.
- 4. Ms. Britt lacks knowledge sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations in paragraph four of the complaint.

- 5. Ms. Britt denies the allegations in paragraph five of the complaint.
- 6. Ms. Britt admits the allegations in paragraph six of the compliant.
- 7. Ms. Britt admits the allegations in paragraph seven of the complaint.
- 8. Ms. Britt admits the allegations in paragraph eight of the complaint, though she denies the referenced petition was sufficient under the Charter and Ohio law.
- 9. In response to paragraph nine of the complaint Ms. Britt admits that Relators quote various sections of The City of Cleveland's charter, but she denies any implication that the three cited sections in and of themselves control the filing of initiative petitions.
- 10. Ms. Britt admits that Relators filed certain papers on or about April 2, 2019, but denies that those papers constituted valid petition papers as described in paragraph ten of the complaint.
- 11. In response to paragraph 11 of the complaint Ms. Britt denies that a final determination had been made concerning the validity of the petition papers. Prior to the April 12, 2019 deadline Ms. Britt determined that the papers were not in the proper form to be considered valid petition papers.
- 12. In response to paragraph 12 of the complaint Ms. Britt admits that she notified Relators that she would determine the sufficiency of the petition within the time period prescribed by law.
- 13. In response to paragraph 13 of the complaint Ms. Britt admits that one of the things she must determine is that whether the petition is signed by the requisite number of electors. She denies that it is the only thing she must determine. She must also determine whether the petitions use a correct form.

- 14. In response to paragraph 14 of the complaint Ms. Britt admits that she notified Relators that the petitions do not contain the required statutory language, and that they were invalid as a result. She denies all other allegations in paragraph 14.
- 15. Ms. Britt denies the allegations contained in paragraph 15 of the Complaint as being an insufficient description of her duties as a Clerk. Without waiving her denial Ms. Britt admits that her authority to review petitions is limited to matters of form and determining the sufficiency of signatures. However, the case cited by Relators does not apply to this matter. In State ex. rel. Langhery (sic) v. Britt, 151 Ohio St.3d 227 (2017) as cited by Relators the issue was whether the clerk could do a substantive analysis to determine whether a proposed ordinance was constitutional. The appropriate and governing decision under the circumstances presented by this matter is State ex. rel. Finkbeiner v. Lucas City Board of Elections, 122 Ohio St.3d 462 (2010). In Finkbeiner as well as this matter the issue is whether the clerk can accept a petition defective in form on its face. The Supreme Court held that the statutory language required by O.R.C. §3501.38(J) requires strict compliance and invalidates petitions that do not have the exact language. This was true even when that requirement is not explicitly in the city charter. Id.at ¶35. In the present case, Relators' petitions lack the exact same language as described in Finkbeiner. Attached to this answer as Exhibit A is a sample of the form used by these Relators. On its face, it does not have the required language of O.R.C. 3501.38(J), and, therefore, does not qualify as a petition for referendum.
- 16. In response to paragraph 16 of the complaint, Ms. Britt denies that Relators have accurately described the response by the Cuyahoga County Board of Elections. The Board of Elections reported that the signatures were before the board, and were sufficient.

However, the Board of Elections further pointed out to Ms. Britt that the petitions did not have the required statutory language. The determination of the sufficiency of the form of the petitions was for Ms. Britt to determine.

- 17. Ms. Britt denies the allegations in paragraph 17 of the complaint.
- 18. Ms. Britt admits the letter referenced in paragraph 18 of the complaint and attached as exhibit 5 to the Complaint was sent to the City of Cleveland's Law Director.
- 19. In response to paragraph 19 of the complaint, Ms. Britt admits only that the Law Director declined Mr. Dann's request of May 8, 2019 and denies all remaining allegations to include the allegation that the request was lawful based on the Relators' failure to comply with the required and established legal form for petitions.
- 20. In response to paragraph 20 of the complaint, Ms. Britt denies that a Writ of Mandamus is appropriate in this case.
- 21. Ms. Britt responds to paragraph 21 of the complaint in the same manner as above.
- 22. In response to paragraph 22 Ms. Britt denies that a writ of Mandamus is appropriate in this case.
- 23. Ms. Britt denies that paragraph 23 of the complaint accurately states the applicable law, and denies that the elements of a Writ of Mandamus are met in this matter.
- In response to paragraph 24 of the complaint Ms. Britt denies that Relators have properly stated her legal duty for purposes of this Mandamus action. Ms. Britt admits that while she must determine the sufficiency of signatures for a petition, paragraph 24 does not fully describe all her duties. Ms. Britt is also responsible to determine if the

form of the petitions is sufficient. In this case, the petition forms lacked required statutory language.

- 25. The allegations in paragraph 25 of the complaint are denied.
- 26. The allegations in paragraph 26 of the complaint are denied.

AFFIRMATIVE AND ADDITIONAL DEFENSE

1. Harmonization of the provisions of the City's Charter with the applicable Ohio statutes establishes as a matter of law that the Relators have failed to state a claim upon which the requested mandamus relief may be granted.

WHEREFORE, having fully answered the Complaint, Respondent respectfully requests that the Court deny the order of mandamus requested by Relators and that the Complaint be dismissed with prejudice at the earliest moment.

Respectfully submitted,

BARBARA LANGHENRY (#0038838) DIRECTOR OF LAW

/s/ Stewart Hastings

STEWART HASTINGS (#0025852)
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF LAW
ELENA BOOP (#0072907)
CHIEF ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF LAW
City of Cleveland – Department of Law
601 Lakeside Avenue – Room 106
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
Telephone -- (216) 218-2898
Facsimile -- (216) 664-2663
LSHASTINGS@city.cleveland.oh.us
EBOOP@city.cleveland.oh.us
ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENT
PATRICIA BRITT

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a true and accurate copy of Defendants' foregoing Answer was served by electronic means through the court's E-filing system this 15th day of July 2019.

/s/ Stewart Hastings

Stewart Hastings
Assistant Director of Law

EXHIBIT A

ORDINANCE BY INITIATIVE PETITION

Pursuant to the Charter of the City of Cleveland, Chapter 7 To be signed by five thousand (5,000) qualified electors of the City of Cleveland.

NOTICE - Whoever knowingly signs this petition more than once, signs a name other than his own, or signs when not a legal voter, is liable to prosecution.

We, the undersigned, electors of the City of Cleveland, Ohio hereby submit to the Clerk of Council of the City of Cleveland, Ohio a proposed ordinance by initiative petition pursuant to the Cleveland City Charter Sections 49-58.

COMMITTEE OF THE PETITIONERS

We hereby designate the following electors of the City as a committee pursuant to the Cleveland City Charter, Section 49, and to be regarded as filing this ordinance and constituting a Committee of the Petitioners:

Lawrence Bresler	2671 Haddam Rd., Cleveland, Ohio 44120
Rosemarie E. Driscoll	4605 Bridge Ave., Cleveland, Ohio 44102
Jesse H. Faley	1444 West 81 st St., Cleveland, Ohio 44102
Yvonka M. Hall	18115 Harvard Ave., Cleveland, Ohio 44128
Jeffrey D. Johnson	13508 Larchmere Blvd., Cleveland, Ohio 44120
Diana King	12526 Griffing Ave., Cleveland, Ohio 44120
Chris Knestrick	3320 Monroe Ave., Cleveland, Ohio 44113
Jeffrey B. Mixon	1188 East 86 th St., Cleveland, Ohio 44108
Christopher Stocking	6404 Bridge Ave., Cleveland, Ohio 44102
Darrick Wade	3750 Fleming Ave. #303, Cleveland, Ohio 44115

Electronically Filed 07/15/2019 10:04 / ANSWERS / CV 19 916774 / Confirmation Nbr. 1761571 / BATCH

MUST USE MOST RECENT ADDRESS ON FILE WITH BOARD OF ELECTIONS

(Sign with ink. Your name, residence, and date of signing must be given.)

		1. Signature	Print Full Name			
	1	(fleur) 00h	Koloun	Juory	1.5 A	
		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)		nterent un entre ent E	tere efficient conflict and the deliverse to the second second second second second second second second second	
		1055 8: 78+4 5+			N + + # . 2012 33.114	
		City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Zip Code	County	Date	
		Cieveland	44103	Cuyahoga	3.8.19	
		2. Signature	Print Full Name			
	-0	MATHORN Hartton	Hathleen	M. Hazi	1400	
	3	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)				
I,_	(D)	19601 VON MEN 200	50			
el		City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Zip Code	County Cuyahoga	Date	
Q.1"		Brake HLS. OH	44122	Cayanoga	0/8/19	
ci	~	3. Signature	Print Full Name	eren (
	3		Knskn t	MSC.		
tľ		Voter Registration Address - Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	1. ~ 7 7		\$	
tı		200 Chatham Way of	77) 45			
8.8		City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Zip Code 44/74	County Cuyahoga	Date // //	
_		i cic v civila	1 / 3 Currel 3 / Null	Cayanoga	1 1/1 (/ / / / / / / / / / / / / / / /	
S					771	
5		4. Signature	Print Full Name		770	
5	Q	- Talle France		1905	7770	
(f) Yesh	3	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	Print Full Name	19615	<u> </u>	
0	R	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 2632 Hampshire Rd.	Print Full Name Martha L		Y 3/ ()	
S	B	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 3632 HampShire Pd. City, Village, or Township	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code	County	Date 7 (19)	
() ha	B	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) REGISTAL HAMPShire P.d. City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L		Date 3/8/19	
(f) harden		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 3632 HampShire Pd. City, Village, or Township	Print Full Name Martha L. Zip Code 440 L. Print Full Name	County Cuyahoga	100 / 100	
(C) hade	Ch. AD	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 3632 Hawpshire Pd. City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L	County Cuyahoga	100 / 100	
(7)		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) REGISTAL HAMPShire P.d. City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Print Full Name Martha L. Zip Code 440 L. Print Full Name	County Cuyahoga	100 / 100	
() hade		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 3632 Hawpshire Pd. City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	Print Full Name Martha L. Zip Code 44106 Print Full Name JOR JOR	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	
(C) hande		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township	Print Full Name Martha L. Zip Code 440 L. Print Full Name	County Cuyahoga	100 / 100	
(C)		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L Print Full Name JOR JO: Zip Code 4412G	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	
() x-t-		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township	Print Full Name Martha L. Zip Code 44106 Print Full Name JOR JOR	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	
(C) hade		Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 2632 HampShire Pd. City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 6. Signature	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L Print Full Name JOR JO: Zip Code 4412G	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	
() hade	SR	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 2632 HampShire Pd. City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 6. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L Print Full Name JOR JO: Zip Code 4412G	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	
(C) hade	SR	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 6. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code HHOL Print Full Name JOR JOS Zip Code HHAG Print Full Name ANGLA	County Cuyahoga County Cuyahoga Cuyahoga	3/8/19 Date 3/8/19	
(C) hade	SR	Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) 2632 HampShire Pd. City, Village, or Township Cleveland 5. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box) City, Village, or Township Cleveland 6. Signature Voter Registration Address – Number and Street (No P.O. Box)	Print Full Name Martha L Zip Code 4410L Print Full Name JOR JO: Zip Code 4412G	County Cuyahoga	3/8/19	

CIRCULATOR STATEMENT

I, Local Ded Mey (Printed Name of Circulator), declare under penalty of
election falsification that I reside at the address appearing below my signature; that I am the
circulator of the foregoing petition containing 26 (Number) signatures; that I witnessed
the affixing of every signature; that all signers were to the best of my knowledge and belief qualified
to sign; that these petition papers contained a copy of the proposed ordinance in full; and that every
signature is to the best of my knowledge and belief the signature of the person whose signature it
purports to be or of an attorney in fact acting pursuant to Section 3501.382 of the Revised Code.
(Signature of Circulator)
1431 Winchester Re
(Permanent residence address)
Laker bud , DH 44107
(City or Village, State, and Zip Code)